Category 4: Short answer and response to stimulus test

This sample has been compiled by the QSA to help teachers plan and develop assessment instruments for individual school settings.

This test was designed for a Year 11 class. Formatting has been removed to allow focus on the range and type of questions/items.

While effective instrument design provides opportunities for demonstration of the full range of syllabus standards, the annotations on the instrument point to opportunities to demonstrate aspects of Standard A in:

- Criterion 2: Forming historical knowledge through critical inquiry
- Criterion 3: Communicating historical knowledge

Assessment instrument

Comments

This item provides opportunities for students to demonstrate an aspect of Criterion 3 at Standard A:
- consistently communicates accurately recalled or selected definitions, key historical concepts, terms, events, developments and people, and the relationships amongst them.

This item allows students to communicate historical definitions from Standards A to E.

Theme: Studies of power
Inquiry topic: Russia under Stalin

Part A — Definitions

1. Select two of the following terms and define the meaning as seen in practice in Russia:
   - Socialism
   - War Communism
   - New Economic Plan
   - Five-Year Plans.

2. Select two of the following people/organisations and explain their role in Russian history:
   - Lenin
   - Trotsky
   - Kerensky
   - Okhrana
   - NKVD.

3. Select two of the following events and describe why they were significant developments in Russian history:
   - October Manifesto
   - February Revolution
   - Treaty of Brest-Litovsk
   - Civil War.
Comments

This item is an example of how brief, point-form responses may still allow opportunities to demonstrate responses at Standards A to E for aspects of Criterion 3. There are other opportunities in the paper for longer responses.

This item provides opportunity for students to demonstrate Standard-A descriptors:

- **consistently communicates** accurately recalled or selected definitions, key historical concepts, terms, events, developments and people, and the relationships amongst them
- **presents coherent, valid historical arguments that:**
  - incorporate concepts of change and continuity over time

Part B — Backgrounds, changes and continuities

1. Complete this table to show your understanding of the background to the Russian Revolution. Why did each of these situations contribute to the Tsar’s failure to maintain the confidence of the people and his eventual loss of power?
   (You may answer in point form.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Situation</th>
<th>Key points</th>
<th>Why did this contribute to the tsar’s loss of power?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The difficulties of ruling Russia</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 1905 Revolution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The problems of WWI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This item is an example of how students may demonstrate the Criterion 2, Standard-A descriptor:

- uses a diversity of primary and secondary sources to:
  - comprehend and apply explicit and implicit meanings
  - analyse to identify implicit and explicit patterns of information and categorise evidence
  - perceptively interpret values and motives and identify perspectives.

This item allows for demonstration of a range of standards, because different decisions and reasoning will be evident in responses depending on the implicit meanings, values and motives identified.

These questions provide opportunities to demonstrate the Criterion 2, Standard-A descriptors:

- uses a diversity of primary and secondary sources to:
  - comprehend and apply explicit and implicit meanings
  - perceptively interpret values and motives and identify perspectives, while acknowledging the time period and context of the production of a source
  - evaluates the relevance, representativeness, likely accuracy and likely reliability of sources.

### Part C — Sources

Sources A–D present different perspectives on Stalin.

1. What information do the sources provide about Stalin’s contribution to the Soviet Union? Complete the table below by categorising the evidence in each source. (You may not need to use all the three categories provided.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources that present a positive view of Stalin</th>
<th>Reasoning/evidence from sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>e.g. Source A</td>
<td>e.g. reasoning from Source A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources that present a negative view of Stalin</th>
<th>Reasoning/evidence from sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sources that present a neutral view of Stalin</th>
<th>Reasoning/evidence from sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Refer to Source A.**

2. Is Source A representative of the dominant view of historians of Stalin’s leadership? Explain your reasoning.

**Refer to Source B.**

3. How relevant (useful) would this source be to a historian investigating how Russians felt about their leader?

**Refer to Source C.**

Stalin died in 1953. Khrushchev and three others ruled by committee. By 1955 Khrushchev was the dominant member of the ‘collective leadership’, and he was appointed Prime Minister in 1958. Source C is an extract from a much longer speech made by the Party Secretary Khrushchev in 1956 at the Congress of the Communist Party.

4. What bias is evident in Khrushchev’s speech about Stalin?

5. In describing Stalin’s approach, what does Khrushchev want to tell his audience about his own values and ideas about leadership?

6. Consider the information provided about the time and context in which Khrushchev made this speech. Why do you think Khrushchev waited for three years, until 1956, to make these official statements about Stalin?

7. Which source (A, B, C or D) do you consider the most reliable source of information about Stalin’s personality? Justify your decision.
Part D — Effects, Interests and Arguments

**Sources E–H** present different points of view about Stalin’s policy of collectivisation and the effects of the policy in the Ukraine.

1. Answer True or False to each of the following statements about Sources E–H. For each question, justify your decision in the space below.
   a. Source F implies that the Kulaks were trying to destroy the Soviet Union. Justification: _____
   b. Source G states that the Kulaks were the poorest, most vulnerable peasants. Justification: _____
   c. Source G implies that Stalin needed the labour of the Kulaks to turn Russia into a modern industrial state. Justification: _____
   d. Source H corroborates the claim in Source F that there were grain surpluses that could be collected for the state. Justification: _____

2. In Source E, apart from “obliteration” of the Kulaks, what other reason is suggested for Stalin’s campaign?

3. Consider the information in Source G about the Ukraine. What motive may have been behind Stalin’s speech in Source F?

4. How accurate is Fedor Belov’s account (Source H) of the situation in the Ukraine likely to have been?

5. Is there evidence in Sources E or H to support the argument in Source G that Stalin “orchestrated one of history’s most wretched genocides”? Justify your decision by referring to the evidence presented in Sources E and H.

Part E — Reflections and responses

In this study of Russia, you have investigated the power of individuals and the state through half a century of change. Answer the following question in a paragraph that reflects on your studies about Stalin and his power and leadership of the Soviet Union.

Stalin said, “You cannot make a revolution with silk gloves.” How was this belief evident in the way Stalin wielded power and led the Soviet Union?

*The expression “silk gloves” means a gentle approach.

The responses to all items across the sample assessment instrument provide opportunities to demonstrate most aspects of Criterion 3: Communicating historical knowledge. In particular, responses to Part C and Part D require students to incorporate reference to sources of historical evidence.
Comments
The selection of sources provides opportunities for students to use a diversity of primary and secondary sources that offer a range of perspectives.

For example, Part D offers a range of perspectives, including those of a:
- US eyewitness
- collective farm leader
- Stalin
- contemporary Western journalist.

The brief contextual details provided allow the students to identify and consider the complexity of the perspectives in some sources. For example, the US journalist acknowledges that he had been supportive of the regime and changed his views later in life.

The syllabus allows for the use of both seen and unseen sources in Category 4 instruments (p. 52). The time available for the test, the stage of the course, and the length of the sources should be considered when making decisions about sources.

Sources List

Source A (seen): Avidenko
“Hymn to Stalin” by Russian citizen AO Avidenko.
Available at Modern History sourcebook: www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/stalin-worship.html.

Source B (unseen): Soviet government
Propaganda poster of Stalin
Available at: Google Images (exact source not provided)

Source C (unseen): Khrushchev
Extract from a much longer speech made by the Party Secretary Khrushchev in 1956 at the Congress of the Communist Party.
Available at: www.historyguide.org/europe/khrush_speech.html.

Source D (seen): BBC
Extract from Historic figures series on Joseph Stalin.
Available at: www.bbc.co.uk/history/historic_figures/stalin_joseph.shtml.

Source E (unseen) Eugene Lyons
Extract from Assignment in Utopia, autobiography of Eugene Lyons, American journalist and United Press reporter in Moscow from 1928–1929. The introduction of his book says this is the “atonement” of a man who came to serve the revolution and was a “friendly correspondent” in Moscow. Available at: http://books.google.com.au.

Source F (seen) Stalin
Extracts from Stalin’s speech about Collectivisation in 1928.

Source G (seen) Steve Waldon
Extract from The Age article “Ukraine’s harvest of sorrow”, written March 8 2008 to commemorate the 75th anniversary of Holodomor.

Source H (unseen) Fedor Belov
Extract from recollections of a collective farm leader.
## Instrument-specific criteria and standards

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard A</th>
<th>Standard B</th>
<th>Standard C</th>
<th>Standard D</th>
<th>Standard E</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In response to historical questions about Russia, the student:</td>
<td>In response to historical questions about Russia, the student:</td>
<td>In response to historical questions about Russia, the student:</td>
<td>In response to historical questions about Russia, the student:</td>
<td>In response to historical questions about Russia, the student:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• uses a diversity of primary and secondary sources to:</td>
<td>• uses primary and secondary sources to:</td>
<td>• generally uses primary and secondary sources to:</td>
<td>• generally, when dealing with historical sources:</td>
<td>• includes some information relevant to a factual inquiry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>− comprehend and apply explicit and implicit meanings</td>
<td>− comprehend explicit and implicit meanings</td>
<td>− identifies basic explicit meanings</td>
<td>− comprehends some factual detail in a basic historical source</td>
<td>− comprehends some factual detail in a basic historical source</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>− analyse to identify implicit and explicit patterns of information and</td>
<td>− analyse to identify explicit patterns and allocate information to</td>
<td>− groups information according to identified classifications</td>
<td>− recognises information with some common characteristics in a basic</td>
<td>− recognises information with some common characteristics in a basic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>categorise evidence</td>
<td>categories</td>
<td></td>
<td>historical source</td>
<td>historical source</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>− perceptively interpret values and motives and identify perspectives,</td>
<td>− interpret values and motives and identify perspectives</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>while acknowledging the time period and context of the production of</td>
<td>− corroborate secondary sources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>− corroborate primary and secondary sources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• evaluates the relevance, representativeness, likely accuracy and likely</td>
<td>• identifies simple and familiar concepts, values and motives that are</td>
<td>• refers to mainly secondary sources to make obvious decisions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reliability of sources</td>
<td>explicit</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• synthesises evidence from primary and secondary sources to justify</td>
<td>• analyse to identify obvious themes or patterns</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>insightful decisions</td>
<td>• recognise relevant sources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• detect bias in sources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• refers to mainly secondary sources to make obvious decisions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In response to historical questions about Russia, the student:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• generally, when dealing with historical sources:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>− comprehends some factual detail in a basic historical source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• recognises information with some common characteristics in a basic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>historical source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In response to historical questions about Russia, the student:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• includes some information relevant to a factual inquiry</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• comprehends some factual detail in a basic historical source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• recognises information with some common characteristics in a basic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>historical source</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standard A</td>
<td>Standard B</td>
<td>Standard C</td>
<td>Standard D</td>
<td>Standard E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| On balance, across short and paragraph answers in test conditions, the student:  
- consistently communicates accurately recalled or selected definitions, key historical concepts, terms, events, developments and people, and the relationships amongst them  
- presents coherent, valid historical arguments that:  
  - incorporate concepts of change and continuity over time  
  - use extensive vocabulary in a succinct and effective manner  
  - accord closely with the style and conventions applicable to the format of the task  
  - refer to evaluation processes without disrupting the argument  
  - incorporate direct and indirect references to diverse relevant historical evidence  
- meets stipulated or negotiated requirements of tasks for length, format or scope of responses. | On balance, across short and paragraph answers in test conditions, the student:  
- usually communicates accurately recalled or selected definitions, key historical concepts, terms, events, developments and people  
- presents coherent, credible historical arguments that:  
  - refer to the causes and consequences of changes and continuities over time  
  - use vocabulary effectively  
  - accord for the most part with the style and conventions applicable to the task  
  - incorporate direct and indirect reference to relevant historical evidence  
- meets stipulated or negotiated requirements of tasks in most instances. | On balance, across short and paragraph answers in test conditions, the student:  
- communicates some recalled or selected definitions and descriptions of key historical concepts, terms, events, development and people  
- presents coherent responses that:  
  - use some historical concepts  
  - incorporate some direct reference to appropriate sources of historical evidence  
  - are expressed in descriptive and explanatory language in which the meaning is discernible despite errors in vocabulary, style and conventions  
- usually completes tasks but may not meet all of the stipulated or negotiated requirements. | On balance, across short and paragraph answers in test conditions, the student:  
- communicates some recalled or selected accurate definitions and historical knowledge  
- presents responses to basic historical research questions that:  
  - incorporate some reference to sources of historical evidence  
  - convey meaning that is sometimes discernible despite frequent errors in vocabulary, style and conventions  
- usually completes tasks but may not meet all of the stipulated or negotiated requirements. | On balance, across short and paragraph answers in test conditions, the student:  
- communicates little recall or selection of accurate historical knowledge  
- presents responses to tasks that contain errors in vocabulary, style and conventions that obscure meaning  
- where tasks are completed, rarely meets stipulated or negotiated requirements. |